

David Hiley

*The Chant of Norman Sicily:
Interaction between the Norman and Italian Traditions*

Very little of the chant sung in the Norman kingdom of Sicily was adopted by the Normans from native Italian traditions at first. Practically all was brought from Normandy, or at least from North France. In my article "Quanto c'è di Normanno nei troperi Siculo-Normanni?" (*Rivista Italiana di Musicologia* 18, 1983) I attempted to summarize the relationships between the three well-known Sicilian tropers, and other Sicilian chant manuscripts, and their North French relatives. I ended the article by summarizing the Norman and North French elements in the Sicilian books, pointing out demonstrable direct or indirect links with

- | | |
|--------------------------------|---|
| — Norman cathedrals: | Rouen
Evreux |
| — Norman monasteries: | St.-Evroult
Jumièges
St.-Ouen
Mont-St.-Michel
St.-Wandrille |
| — other North French churches: | Chartres
Paris
Angers |
| — Dijon, St.-Bénigne | |

The evidence for these links is both repertorial and musical. It is a fairly simple matter to compare such repertories as alleluias, sequences and ordinary of mass melodies; I also carried the work of the monks of Solesmes further, in checking variants in the melodies for the proper chants of mass; and I carried out a study of melodic and textual variants in the sequences. In my doctoral thesis, on which that article was based, I also included information on the proper prayers of mass to be found in Sicilian and North French books.

I do not propose to recapitulate this material today. In one sense the Sicilian chant books are not Italian at all. In order to justify including them in the discussion of this Study Session I propose to point out some of the stages in the "Italianization" of the Norman-Sicilian chant repertory. I begin at the stage when the foreign liturgies came to Sicily; then I cite some isolated

Italian compositions in Sicilian books; and then I give an example of the replacement of a Norman-Sicilian by an Italian liturgical book.

(I) *Norman-Sicilian and South Italian alleluias for the post-Pentecost season*

As is by now well known, a convenient method of comparing and contrasting liturgical uses is to look at their selection of alleluias for the post-Pentecost season, the summer Sundays of the year. In order to demonstrate the foreignness of the Norman-Sicilian books I can show the difference between their alleluia series and those of South Italian books from Benevento and Montecassino.

Table 1 shows which alleluias are found in 5 books from Benevento and one from Montecassino, all of the 11th-12th centuries. London British Library Egerton 3511 was formerly Benevento Archivio Capitolare VI.29. (It was acquired by the British Museum, as it then was, in 1944.) Manuscripts 33, 34, 35 and 38 are well-known Beneventan sources, a missal and three graduals. The Vatican manuscript is a missal of the early 12th century from Montecassino.

Practically all the post-Pentecost alleluias in these manuscripts are to be found together in Benevento 35. Only Alleluia Redemptionem misit, 110.9, is missing, and that one appears only in manuscript 38. It looks as if these manuscripts selected their alleluias from some larger collection, which then turns up almost complete in Benevento 35. Or perhaps the man responsible for manuscript 35 simply gathered together all the alleluias he knew were used at this time in the church year.

Whatever the actual course of events, there are 8 alleluias in the series which were unknown to the Normans, marked with a double-asterisk.

I have also, for interest, included the series in the 11th- or 12th-century sacramentary in New York, Pierpont Morgan Library, manuscript 379. This book is said to have been written possibly at Farfa, for a Benedictine monastery in Spoleto. It has some musical notation in Beneventan neumes. It is of special interest because of its version of the Exultet chant: it ends with the form introduced by the Normans: "Qui semper vivis, regnas et imperas, etc.". But the alleluia series is not Norman. Nor is it Beneventan or Cassinese.

The Norman alleluia series is shown in Table 2. One of the tropers now in Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional manuscript 288, which in my opinion was copied for the chapel of the Norman rulers c. 1100, has a series of 27 alleluias for the post-Pentecost Sundays. This series contains all the alleluias to be found in the 12th-century noted missal Palermo Biblioteca Nazionale XIV.F.16 (probably from Palermo), the fragmentary gradual of Siracusa cathedral and the printed missals of Palermo 1534(?), Messina 1480 and Cosenza 1549. With the sole exception of Alleluia Timebunt gentes, 101.16, it also has all the alleluias of the 15th-century missals of San Martino delle Scale near Palermo, Palermo Bibl. Naz. IV.G.3 and I.F.9. But this series must

TABLE 1
Post-Pentecost Alleluias in South Italian Sources
 (numbers refer to Psalm verses, e.g. 5.2 = Psalm 5 Verse 2)

	Lbl Eg. 3511	BV VI. 33	BV VI. 34	BV VI. 35	BV VI. 38	Vat. lat. 6082	NYpm 379
5.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
7.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
7.12	x	x	x	x	x	x	
20.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
30.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
33.12	**	x	x	x	x	x	
54.2	**	x		x	x	x	
58.2	x			x	x	x	
64.2	x		x	x	x	x	x
77.1	x	l	x	x	x	x	x
78.9	**	a			x		
80.2	x	c	x	x	x	x	x
87.2	x	u	x	x	x	x	x
89.1	x	n	x	x	x		x
94.1	x	a		x	x	x	x
94.3	x		x	x	x	x	x
96.1	**			x	x		
99.2	x		x	x	x	x	
101.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
107.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
110.9				x			
113.1	x	x	x	x		x	x
113.B11	x	x	x	x	x	x	
114.1	**	x	x	x	x	x	x
116.1	**		x	x	x	x	
120.1	**	x		x	x		x
124.1				x	x	x	
129.1		x	x	x			
146.3				x			
147.12	**			x			
147.14				x			
Only in NYpm 379:							
8.2							x
17.2							x
18.2							x
24.1							x
67.2							x
101.16							x
145.2							x

** = Not in Table 2

TABLE 2
Post-Pentecost Alleluias in Norman Sources
 (numbers refer to Psalm verses, e.g. 5.2 = Psalm 5 Verse 2)

	Madrid 288	Palermo XIV.F.16	Palermo IV.G.3	Cosenza 1549	Siracusa	Rouen 291	Rouen 277	London 26655
5.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
7.2	x	x	x	x	x	x		x
7.12	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
17.2 **	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
20.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
30.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
46.2 **	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	
47.2 **	x							
58.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
64.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
77.1	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
80.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
87.2	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
89.1	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
94.1	x	x	x	x	lac.	x	x	x
94.3	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
101.2	x	x	x	x	x			
101.16 **			x					
104.1 **	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
107.2	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
113.B11	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
117.16 **	x						x	x
124.1	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
129.1	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
137.1 **	x				x	x		
145.2 **	x	x	x	x	x		x	x
146.3	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
147.14	x			x		x	x	x

Palermo I.F.9 = Palermo IV.G.3 but omits 129.1

Palermo Rari 571, a printed missal of Palermo of ?1534 = Cosenza 1549 but has a lacuna at 30.2, and omits 146.3

The printed missal of Messina of 1480 = Cosenza 1549

** = Not in Table 1

originally have come from Normandy, which is proved by the fact that Madrid 288 also has all the alleluias of books from the monastery of St. Wandrille (Rouen 291), Rouen cathedral (Rouen 277) and Evreux (London 26655).

Eight of these alleluias are not in the South Italian books.

(II) *Italian Agnus Dei chants in Madrid 19421*

Although most of the material in the well-known Norman-Sicilian troopers was imported from the North, there are some instances of Italian influence in them. As an example I have chosen the Agnus Dei chants at the end of the collection in Madrid Biblioteca Nacional 19421, from Catania.

Madrid 19421 has more sequences and ordinary of mass chants than any of the other Sicilian books. In fact it has one of the most extensive of all collections, including the biggest number of Glorias tropes of any manuscript now known.

Not only does it contain almost all the items known from the Palermo troopers Madrid 288 and 289 (it has all their Glorias), it contains practically every ordinary of mass chant to be found in the Troia troper, Napoli Biblioteca Nazionale VI.G.34. The basis of these collections is clearly Norman. In purely statistical terms Madrid 19421 has more concordances with the St. Evroult troper than with any other manuscript except Madrid 289.

Not only does Madrid 19421 usually display comprehensive Norman repertoires, it also usually includes some unique items which suggest a degree of local initiative. Italian imports are kept to a minimum. The figures for Kyries, Glorias and Sanctus show this well; but with the Agnus chants the picture is different:

	Kyrie		Gloria		Sanctus		Agnus	
	mel.	tro.	mel.	tro.	mel.	tro.	mel.	tro.
Total	22	24	8	49	17	31	7	15
Norman	2	8	1	3	2	4		4
Italian						2	2	3
Sicilian	1				2	1		
Unique	3	3		2	2	6		

The clearest contrast is between the Sanctus and Agnus chants: no unique Agnus chants, as against 2 unique Sanctus melodies and 6 tropes. And a sudden increase in Italian compositions. In Madrid 289, by contrast, we find:

	Sanctus		Agnus	
	mel.	tro.	mel.	tro.
Total	17	19	7	12
Norman	3	3		3
Italian		1		
Sicilian	1	1		

Now among the additions to Madrid 289 there is in fact a unique troped Agnus which caught the eye of Gunilla Iversen, of the *Corpus Troporum*. This is the trope *Conditor polorum*, which lacks music. Iversen saw that the form of the trope is Italian:

trope	Agnus ... nobis
trope	Agnus ... nobis
trope	Agnus ... nobis

It looks as if this late addition to the Sicilian repertory was therefore composed by someone trained in the Italian tradition.

Iversen did not investigate Madrid 19421, since it was written later than most of her other sources. The last three Agnus Dei chants in this manuscript are clearly Italian, as one can see from their concordances: they occur in many Italian books, hardly ever outside Italy. What is surprising here is not so much that an Italian composition *per se* should have been taken into the Catania repertory, but that there are big differences in style between the normal type of Agnus Dei sung by the Normans and those sung by Italians. The typically Italian pieces have one or all of the following traits:

(I) the Agnus Dei invocation is not split up by the trope; the trope verse either precedes or follows the invocation; it was more common in the North and in Sicily to split the invocation after “mundi” and insert the trope verse there;

(II) each trope verse is often made up of 4 or 5 short lines of 4, 5 or 6 syllables, 2 of them accented; outside Italy longer lines were favoured;

(III) each Agnus invocation and each trope verse use the same melody, slightly varied to accommodate the different texts; elsewhere variety is usual.

All these things must have seemed strange to Norman trained singers, and yet such Italian pieces found their way into Madrid 19421. Perhaps the scribe had no way of expanding his rather small repertory, other than reaching out to the chants of his Italian neighbours.

The last Agnus chant, with trope *Salus et vita*, is a perfect example of the Italian style. (Ex. 1)

Every other source is Italian (Iversen trope no. 66, Schildbach Melody 81? but much garbled if so; Schildbach thinks variant of 236; Schildbach trope no. 117). There are some text variants not found in Iversen: “mundi vita” at the end of trope verse 1 is unique, and other sources have “miserere famulis” at the end of verse 2. Verse 3 is partly borrowed from a different trope set whose first verse is “Omnipotens pater pius et clemens”, a Norman trope found a few pages earlier in Madrid 19421. The melody there is quite different.

The first in this small group of three Agnus chants at the end of Madrid 19421 (Schildbach melody 236, trope I, Iversen trope I) is also clearly Italian in distribution and in style. (Ex. 2)

Here the scribe has begun with the Agnus invocation, but also gives a cue at the end for singing it a fourth time. Does this betray some unfamiliar-

ity with the Italian order of performance? Perhaps we should not invariably expect three invocations. As it stands in Madrid 19421, the piece does have a certain symmetry.

The case of the other Agnus is more problematical. (Ex. 3) The Agnus melody (Schildbach 95) has only Italian concordances, but appears in South Italy with the verses *Fulgida qui regnas*, *Alpha et O* and *Ipse ad patriam*. Monza 77 has *O lucis splendor* as third verse instead of *Ipse ad patriam*. Madrid 19421, Paris 1235 (from Nevers) and three Italian sources have *O lucis splendor* first and push *Fulgida* and *Alpha* back (Iversen 26). But no other source quite agrees with the order in Madrid 19421.

TABLE 3
Trope Verses O lucis splendor, fulgida qui regnas, etc.

	Fulgida qui regnas	Alpha et O	Ipse ad patriam	O lucis splendor
Urb. lat. 602 (Montecassino)	1	2	3	
Montecassino 546 (Montecassino)	1	2	3	
Benevento 34 (Benevento)	1	2	3	
Benevento 35 (Benevento)	1	2	3	
Monza 77 (Monza)	1	2		3
Vercelli 161 (Vercelli)	2	3		1
Torino F.IV.18 (Bobbio)	2	3		1
Modena O.I.7 (Forlimpopoli)	2	3		1
Paris n.a.l. 1235 (Nevers)	2	3		1
Madrid 19421 (Catania)	3	2		1

This piece is not as strongly Italian in style as the other two. The first part of the Agnus melody is not used for the trope verses. Perhaps for this reason, it appears in Madrid 19421 Norman-fashion, that is, the Agnus invocations are chopped in half and the trope verses inserted in between. (The same happens in Paris 1235: see Iversen Plates X-XI). But once again there are a couple of untidinesses which may indicate that the scribe's mind was not quite in tune with the situation. He had already copied "miserere nobis" at

the end of the first invocation, as if the Italian form were to be used. Then at the end he forgot that "Dona nobis pacem," was the rule in the Catania manuscript, and wrote "(M)iserere nobis". The writer of the capital letter gave him a "D" anyway.

(III) *The Sicilian pontificals*

The Agnus Dei chants in Madrid 19421 show Norman and Italian traditions meeting, and to some extent clashing. My final paragraphs are devoted to a group of books which have received little attention (at least from musicologists: art historians have shown some interest), the surviving pontificals and benedictionals from Sicily. I know of 6:

Milano, Ambrosiana A.92 Infra	written in Palermo in 1165
Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional 742	late 12th century (in Messina Cathedral in the 15-16th century)
Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional 678	13th century (in Messina Cathedral in the 15-16th century)
Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional 715	14th century (in Messina Cathedral in the 15-16th century)
Vaticana lat. 6748	written c. 1300, owned by Arnold Archbishop of Monreale 1306-24
Vaticana lat. 4746	written c. 1300 for Siracusa Cathedral

In the more variable parts of the chant repertory, where the preferences of individual cantors could cause fresh pieces to be adopted, there was naturally plenty of scope for Italian compositions to become popular in Sicily. Since the surviving sources are so meagre, we cannot trace this process very exactly. Another development which can be seen in surviving books is the arrival of new liturgies of the religious orders, in this case the Dominicans, whose impact is evident in the late 13th-century troper Palermo Biblioteca Nazionale I.B.16.

But where there was no pressure for change, things no doubt continued in the established way. Perhaps it was the advent of a new dynasty, when the Aragonese came to power in Sicily, that caused the change we see in the pontificals. I can show this most simply by listing the long series of antiphons which are to be sung during the pontifical ceremony for the Dedication of a Church. As chance would have it, these are also copied in the Palermo troper Madrid 289. They appear in Table 4, from Madrid 289 and the five earliest Sicilian pontificals.

This series derives from Norman practice. In the latest Sicilian pontifical, Madrid 715, a quite different form of ceremony, and hence a quite different series of antiphons, is copied. This is the standard Roman form given in Table 5.

There is still much to be learned about the patterns of tradition and in-

TABLE 4
Antiphons for Dedication of a Church

	Madrid 289	Ambros. A.92 inf.	Madrid 742	Madrid 678	Vat. 6748	Vat. 4746
I Zachee festinans	1	1	1	1	1	1
II Tollite portas		2	2	2	2	2
III Pax huic domini		3	3	3	3	3
IV Pax eterna ab eterno	2		4	4		
V Benedic domine domum	3	4	5	5	4	4
VI Fundamentum aliud	4	5	6		5	5
VII Hec aula accipiet	5	6	7	6	6	6
VIII Asperges me		7	8	7	7	7
IX Sanctificavit dominus	6	8	9	8	8	8
X In dedicatione huius	7	9	10	9	9	9
XI Qui habitat	8	10	11	10	10	10
XII Asperges me (rep.)		11	12	11	11	11
XIII Exurgat deus	9	12	13	12	12	
XIV Fundamenta templi	10	13	14	13	13	12
XV Benedic domine domum	11	14	15	14	14	13
XVI Benedictus es in templo		15	16	15	15	14
XVII Introibo ad altare	12	16	17	16	16	15
XVIII Ecce tabernaculum	13	17	18	17	17	16
XIX Dirigatur domine oratio	14	18	19	18	18	17
XX Erexit Iacob lapidem	15	19	20	19	19	18
XXI Mane surgens Iacob	16	20	21	20	20	19
XXII Vidit Iacob	17	21	22	21	21	20
XXIII Magnus dominus	18					
XXIV O quam metuendus		22	23	22	22	21
XXV Lapides pretiosi	19	23	24	23	23	22
XXVI Domine ad te dirigatur	20	24	25	24	24	23
XXVII Ecce odor filii	21	25	26	25	25	
XXVIII Surgite sancti	22	26	27	26	26	24
XXIX Sanctum et verum lumen	23	27	28	27	27	25
XXX Ingredere benedicite	24	28	29	28	28	26
XXXI Exultabunt sancti	25	29	30	29	29	27
XXXII In celestibus regis	26	30	31	30	30	28
XXXIII Sub altare domini	27	31	32	31	31	29
XXXIV Corpora sanctorum	28	32	33	32	32	30
XXXV Ornaverunt faciem	29	33	34	33	33	31
XXXVI Circumdate Syon levite	30	34	35	34	34	32
XXXVII Ab oriente porte tres	31	35	36	35	35	33
XXXVIII Confirma hoc deus		36	37	36	36	34

TABLE 5
Dedication Antiphons - Roman Series

	Roman	Madrid 715	(cf. Table 4)
I Fundata est	1	1	
II Benedic domine domum	2	2	V
III Tu domine universorum	3	3	
IV Zachae festinans	4	4	I
V O quam metuendus	5	5	XXIV
VI Asperges me ysopo	6	6	VIII/XII
VII Haec est domus domini	7	7	
VIII Exsurgat deus	8	8	XIII
IX Qui habitat in adiutorio	9	9	XI
X Domus mea domus orationis	10	10	
XI Introibo ad altare	11	11	XVII
XII O quam gloriosum	12	12	
XIII Movete sancti	13	13	
XIV Via sanctorum	14	14	
XV Cum jucunditate	15	15	
XVI Ambulate ... ingredimini	16	16	
XVII Ambulate ... ad locum		17*	
XVIII Erit mihi dominus	17	18	
XIX Ingedimini benedicti	18	19	cf. XXX
XX Exultabunt sancti	19	20	XXXI
XXI Sub altare domini	20	21	XXXIII
XXII Ascendit fumus	21		
XXIII Dirigatur domine oratio		22	XIX
XXIV Erexit Iacob lapidem	22	23	XX
XXV Mane surgens Iacob	23	24	XXI
XXVI Ecce odor filii	24	25	XXVII
XXVII Haec est domus domini	25	26	
XXVIII Aedificavit Moyses	26	27	
XXIX Dirigatur oratio	27	28	
XXX Confirma hoc deus	28	29	XXXVIII
XXXI Corpora sanctorum	29	30	XXXIV
XXXII Circumdate Syon	30	31	XXXVI

* In pre-Innocentine pontifical.

fluence in liturgical music books. Even when we have discovered the various lines of similarity linking manuscripts there will still remain other questions, about how various traditions were transmitted and came to be established in their various churches. Some areas have been brought into focus, but we are still far from being able to see the overall picture clearly. This is particularly the case in Italy, so much more individualistic in its practices than other countries, and yet possibly holding the key to the solution of some of the most important problems chant scholars face.

Other researchers have a more difficult task than I have had: Sicily presents relatively few problems because the Norman and Italian traditions were so markedly different. What is interesting and encouraging for a musicologist is that the differences are not purely liturgical and repertorial but also concern musical style. The musicologist can therefore make a unique contribution to the study of the church in medieval Italy.

Ex. 1. - Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 19421, f. 98^r: Agnus Dei trope Salus et vita.

Sa-lus et ui-ta pax per-pe-tu-a lux in-de-fi-ci-ens mun-di ui-ta

Ag-nus de-i qui tol-lis pec-ca-ta mun-di mi-se-re-re no-bis

sup-pli-cum pre-ces be-nig-ne e-xaudi atque tu-is fa-mu-lis

Ag-nus

Om-ni-po-tens pater pi-us et clemens atque sanctus concede nobis pa-cem

Ag-nus de-i

Ex. 2. - Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 19421, f. 97: Agnus Dei trope Ad dextram Patris.

A-g-nus de-i qui tol-lis pec-ca-ta mun-di mi-se-re-re no-bis

Ad dextram patris re-si-de qui semper sal-ua et parce tu-is al-me

A-g-nus

Quos tu-o sa-cro re-de-misti cru-o-re absque la-be custodi pastor bone

A-g-nus

Et te Ju-cente pos-si-mus ue-ni-re ad te sancte cuncto be-nigne

A-g-nus de-i

Ex. 2. - Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, 19421, f. 97^v: Agnus Dei trope Ad dextram Patris.

A-g-nus de-i qui tol-lis pec-ca-ta mun-di mi-se-re-re no-bis

Ad dextram patris re-si-de qui semper sal-ua et parce tu-is al-me

A-g-nus

Quos tu-o sa-cro re-de-misti cru-o-re absque la-be custodi pastor bone

A-g-nus

Et te Ju-cente pos-si-mus ue-ni-re ad te sancte cuncto be-nigne

A-g-nus de-i